Transformation of Prostitution Services and Stigma Against Women Prostitutes (WTS): Literature Review

Mohamad Iqbal Tawakal[1✉], and Johanna Debora Imelda[2]

[1,2] Department of Social Welfare, Universitas Indonesia
✉Jl. Margonda Raya, Pondok Cina, Kecamatan Beji, Kota Depok, Jawa Barat 16424, Indonesia
✉ m.iqbal04@ui.ac.id

Article Info	ABSTRACT
	The advances in digital technology have encouraged providers of prostitution to move from conventional prostitution to cyber prostitution. This transformation also creates opportunities and threats for WTS when they are active in prostitution business practices. Although the vehicle for WTS practice has changed, the stigma against WTS continues to grow and is even more varied. This study comprehensively describes the conditions of the WTS social environment, including cases regarding the personal condition of WTS and the growing stigma against WTS, the transformation of prostitution services in the digital era, and how the social resilience of WTS in the business. This article is descriptive. The research method used is a literature review. In this study, it was found that in their daily work activities, WTS often experience stigmatization and threats of environmental violence. The stigma obtained has had an impact on the emergence of post-traumatic stress so that the mental health of WTS is disturbed. Another finding is that the transformation of prostitution services from conventional to cyber in fact, not only makes WTS receive stigma directly but also gets stigmatized through cyber media. For WTS to survive while transforming prostitution, they need the ability to manage and optimize their social capital to be resilient and develop in the environment. It is hoped that this article can be used as an input for policymaking, especially for the empowerment and prevention program for WTS in cyber prostitution based on good practices and findings from studies that have been carried out. © 2022 Politeknik Negeri Bali

INTRODUCTION

Havocscope, the world's leading black market research institute, including prostitution, has estimated worldwide prostitution revenue of $186 billion; estimates for the United States alone, where the industry is largely illegal, exceed $14 billion annually (Juli & Marina, 2019). In more detail, Havocscope calculates world prostitution income by adding up the estimated market value of the countries where prostitution income is available. Revenue estimates come from a variety

of sources, such as public health programs, law enforcement initiatives, and other criminal justice programs, as well as media reports.

From the calculation results, it is known that Indonesia is in position 12 of 24 countries with the highest total income from prostitution with a value of US$ 2.25 billion. The high economic turnover in the prostitution industry certainly cannot be ignored. This has directly become a special attraction for women, especially from lower economic circles to be used as a way to improve the level of welfare, both for themselves and their families.

The Special Capital Region of Jakarta Government through the Social Welfare Service and Sub-Department throughout 2018 and 2019 has recorded the results of outreach and control of Persons with Social Welfare Problems (PMKS) in five areas in DKI Jakarta. From this data, it was found that PMKS for the type of female prostitutes (WTS) and their partners experienced an increase from the original number in 2018 which amounted to 168 WTS, in 2019. It increased to 263 WTS (statistik.jakarta.go.id, 2020).

Types of Persons with Social Welfare Problems (PMKS)	2018	2019	Growth
Homeless	1809	1528	-281
Psychotic/Stress	1431	1096	-335
Buskers	641	462	-179
Abandoned people	618	688	70
Beggars	516	374	-142
Illegal parking attendants	379	140	-239
WTS and partners	168	263	95
Scavengers	103	62	-41
Elderly	98	118	20
Homeless kid	97	224	127

Table 1: Jakarta PMKS data captured by the Jakarta Social Service
statistic.jakarta.go.id (2020) [source]

The data still does not include other WTS (conventional WTS and Cyber WTS) which at the time of handling and controlling were not reached by the Jakarta Social Service. Regarding the practice of cyber prostitution, the Ministry of Communication and Information (Kominfo) in 2019 stated that almost every month the Kominfo content search engine managed to capture more than 1,000 cyber prostitution content, both on websites and social media accounts used for cyber prostitution (Kominfo, 2019).

Cyber prostitution is a new model by offering women a website address. The owner is displaying photos of these women with minimal clothing. Enthusiasts simply call the pimps' cellphone

(mobile) numbers, then these pimps deliver orders to hotel rooms or apartments according to the customer's wishes (Yanto, 2016). Recently, the open and free nature of cyber prostitution video WTS with every opportunity to work alone without pimps.

In its development, applications such as Michat, Tinder, Instagram, and Twitter used by WTS in cyber prostitution activities have provided various facilities to make money. The use of social media applications as a transaction medium has made WTS the flexibility to choose prospective clients, choose a meeting place, to determine rates for each type of service, without having to bother meeting directly with prospective clients.

The practice of cyber prostitution in Jakarta became even more severe when the Covid-19 pandemic hit. The government's policy that prohibits people from doing activities directly makes the migration of activities from offline to online very large. In March 2021 alone, the police arrested 82 teenagers aged 18 years and over consisting of 37 men and 45 women at a hotel in the North Jakarta area. Of the 45 women arrested, 42 of them are WTS (CNN Indonesia, 2021). Cyber prostitution cases also occur in West Jakarta. The police managed to secure 75 people consisting of 2 pimps, 18 underage WTS, and the rest WTS over 18 years old (Tribun, 2021)

It is so open and easy to manage a cyber-prostitution business, in some cases WTS gets complacent with their security while dealing with customers. Because many WTS in this era of cyber prostitution works independently without the supervision of Muncikari or the security forces, it is not uncommon while serving clients, that WTS gets violent, both physical and verbal. In fact, in certain cases, a meeting with a client can lead to death. As previously reported by Detiknews.com (2020), WTS itself, apart from receiving death threats, also turns out to be the target of clients who are met through cyber applications. This condition implies that the type of, WTS in the practice of cyber prostitution is questionable.

Cyber prostitution itself is considered to be a cybercrime, a crime that violates decency through cyber media. Regulations regarding the practice of cyber prostitution in Indonesia are currently referred to in the Information and Electronic Transactions (ITE) Law No. 11 of 2008 Article 27 paragraph (1) of the ITE Law. The law does not specifically regulate cyber prostitution. However, in practice, the people, and tractors of cyber prostitution on social media can be charged with Article 27 of the ITE Law because the practice is considered to violate decency. Based on these laws and regulations, it is explained that perpetrators of cyber prostitution who create status, provide links, or upload electronic information in the form of writing, images, audio, or video, related to the promotion of prostitution can be subject to criminal sanctions in the form of fines and imprisonment.

Although many perpetrators of cyber prostitution cases have been caught and prosecuted, this condition does not immediately deter WTS. This practise is still widespread with the increasing use of social media and sites selling prostitution. Data from Kominfo reveals that so far the government has handled 1.3 million negative content from January to September 2020. Kominfo data (2020) have also stated that negative content is dominated by pornographic content which reaches 1,062,558 content (Juditha, 2021).

The high economic turnover in the prostitution industry certainly cannot be ignored. This has directly, become a unique attraction for women, especially from lower economic circles to be used as a way to improve the level of welfare for both themselves and their families. The reason why WTS generally choose this field as a provision for their livelihood is because of the obstacles experienced by WTS, namely the absence of job opportunities that can be done or opened by them. If WTS wants to work in a factory or other place, the main obstacle for WTS is a diploma from a low level of education and the absence of unique skills that becomes an obstacle in opening job opportunities, either individually or elsewhere (Murdiyanto, 2020).

In cyber prostitution, the opportunities for WTS to receive stigma, physical and verbal violence, threats of fraud, and even murder from clients, as well as legal snares from security forces that lead to detention or fines are very large. However, due to economic pressure and difficult opportunities to find work, WTS activities in cyber prostitution are still common.

Munawaroh (2015) mentions that the level of education is substantial because the high level of education taken by a person will bring him to a ruined life pared to someone who only has education and also does not have special skills. This is what happened to the WTS. Generally, they only have low education which makes it difficult for them to get a job. Because of this condition, the WTS then choose cyber prostitution as a way for them to fulfil their needs.

From the description described above, the study of the social conditions of WTS in the era of cyber prostitution is still not widely discussed comprehensively. These social conditions include the personal condition of the WTS, the environmental view of the WTS, and the social resilience of the WTS. Therefore, the preparation of this article has the aim of seeing a detailed picture of the differences in the social conditions of WTS in the era of cyber prostitution, both in the real environment and in the virtual environment. A further thing that will be seen is the extent to which WTS gets stigmatized while working, what forms of stigma are received by WTS, and how WTS responds to stigma in cyber prostitution. Another thing that will be seen is the social resilience of WTS and what aspects WTS uses to survive.

METHODS

The preparation of this article uses a literature review which, according to Torraco (2005), is carried out to evaluate the state of knowledge about a particular topic. It can be used, for example, to create a research agenda, identify research gaps, or simply address a specific issue. A literature review can also be useful if the aim is to engage in theory development (Snyder, 2019).

Researchers systematically reviewed a collection of literature related to WTS in journals published from 2010 s.d. 2021. There were 11 journals examined that were published in the Journal of Public Health, the Sagepub Journal, and the Springer Journal. Researchers also scan through abstracts, keywords, methodology, results, and findings as well as conclusions to identify those that are considered relevant to the topic in this research. Furthermore, the researchers collected related literature that focused on cyber prostitution, the problems of WTS, and environmental views of WTS for further identification. This literature review will determine the focus of this article and provide a comprehensive understanding of WTS and how they survive in cyber prostitution.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

From the results of a review of the selected journals, researchers found several key aspects that are often mentioned when talking about WTS, especially in the cyber era, such as WTS activities in cyber prostitution, and how WTS survives in cyber prostitution. From the literature review, the researcher then reduced it to three main focuses that can be underlined as important issues in this article, namely the social environment of WTS (personal conditions of WTS and stigma towards WTS); WTS service transformation; and the social resilience of WTS.

Main Theme	The Social Environment of WTS		WTS Service Transformation	Social Resilience of WTS
Subtheme	**Personal Condition of WTS**	**Stigma Against WTS**	-	-
Topics	Variations in post-traumatic stress created by direct and indirect violence.	Strategies for avoiding the WTS's double burden and social isolation.	The shift from conventional to cyber-activity is a high-risk social problem.	Childhood experiences in influencing WTS work motivation and resilience in everyday life.
	WTS factors and problems experienced due to the failure of the life they have lived.	Reduction of the negative stigma against all types of WTS.	The circumstances and reasons why plunge into the world of cyber prostitution.	Inequality in the social support systems practised by some of the world's governments and how the WTS community responds to these policies/attitudes.
	-	Transforming sexual services as a way to escape the public stigma and institutional discrimination.	Factors shifting from conventional to online prostitution and WTS orientation in cyber prostitution.	An overview of WTS exposed to violence and how resilience is among WTS.

Table 2: Issue map of WTS-related journal reviews
        Processed by researchers [source]

The Social Environment of WTS
Poverty and limited options for getting the desired job are one of the various factors why many women, then finally choose prostitution as a place to hang their dreams. Becoming a WTS is considered a shortcut to bringing themselves and their families to the door of prosperity as expected. In general, WTS, especially in Indonesia, do not work for themselves, or their families. Because of this, usually, the income generated by WTS is rarely used by themselves, but rather to be sent back to their hometown, to pay for the living expenses of their parents and school fees for their younger siblings or children. According to Surtees (2004), this condition is included in the general type of prostitution, which is mostly carried out by women to earn money. In other words, in this group, only money is the means of payment. The sellers of sex services in this group generally come from poor families, have low levels of education and become female sex workers due to economic difficulties.

Regarding the factors behind why women choose to become WTS, Jatmikowati (2015) suggests that this can come from outside and inside. Of these factors, the most basic cause of women entering the world of prostitution is their powerlessness to bear the heavy burdens of life. Because they are unable to bear the economic burden in their area of origin (village), they are easily tempted to accept any job offer to earn a living, regardless of the type of work. This is because their education is generally low and they do not have good skills or expertise in other fields. The pressure due to domestic violence and family problems is part of the reason they enter the world of prostitution.

In the group of themes in this study, the focus of discussion is on areas related to the forms of problems faced directly by WTS such as stigma, discrimination, acts of violence from clients, double burden and trauma (mental problems), economic and social helplessness, and fear of being able to free from his current job as a WTS. This condition has created fear in the WTS especially when they have to be faced with the surrounding environment.

A. Personal Condition of WTS

The relationship between WTS and the social environment is an important aspect that needs to be maintained to provide a safe life for WTS. So far, the surrounding environmental conditions tend to be contradictory to what WTS is doing. This attitude of rejection is often shown in the form of violence or stigma against WTS.

This public stigma aimed at WTS has formed a kind of emotional reaction that has formed negative beliefs (self-stigma) which can have an impact on the emergence of fear, loneliness, and feeling different from the majority group which is considered true.

Public stigma (or social/applicable/external/perceived stigma) and self-stigma (or internalized/perceived stigma) are two types of stigma that interact with each other. Public stigma and self-stigma are both formed and manifested at the psychological level of beliefs (stereotypes), emotions (prejudice), and behaviour (discrimination). Stereotypes refer to negative beliefs about a group of people (public stigma) or oneself (self-stigma). Prejudice alludes to emotional reactions associated with dealing with negative beliefs of a group or oneself, which can lead to discriminatory behaviour by the public and stigmatized groups (Nguyen & Li, 2020).

The impact of the stigma directed at WTS is the loss of hope for WTS to be able to meet the economic needs of both themselves and their families through the work they are currently doing. In Indah & Kartasasmita's research (2018), which focuses on the factors of being a WTS and the problems experienced due to the failure of the life they have lived, they discuss a lot about the description of WTS's despair over the violence they receive, both in physical, verbal, and sexual forms. In his research, it is stated that the involvement of WTS in the world of prostitution or prostitution is generally based on low education and skills or difficult economic conditions. This condition then makes WTS feel as if they do not have the opportunity or choice to make money as a provision to survive. This is what ultimately makes WTS often surrender (helpless) to what they get, both from the surrounding environment and work.

The study also found that so far the biggest reason why WTS often get verbal and physical violence while working in the world of prostitution is because of the view in WTS that they are not equal to customers (WTS feel they are inferior and do not deserve to be equalized). In addition, things

that surfaced in them were the notion that they were economically incapable, helpless, and unable to communicate and behave like people in general. So this makes them tend to give up, especially when they get less favourable treatment from those around them. It was so bad that some WTS even admitted that they generally find it difficult to see opportunities, have no hope, even think they can't do anything, have no motivation to do anything, tend to get stressed easily, and feel suicidal easily (Indah & Kartasasmita, 2018).

Although WTS often receive violence both verbally and physically, in practice the type of violence that is considered to have a deep impression on WTS is verbal violence in the form of words, acts of discrimination, or racism. The consequences of this treatment can have far beyond expectations. Alschech et al., (2020) in their research examined the post-traumatic stress conditions experienced by WTS because the burden they received from the environment was too heavy. His research explores several factors that are thought to contribute to the formation of variations in experiences related to post-traumatic stress symptoms experienced by WTS. One of the experiences referred to is issues regarding the racial identity of workers, experiences of discrimination and control over their working conditions, as well as violence experienced, both from the environment and from clients.

Alschech et al., (2020) in their study revealed facts that the burden of discrimination experienced by WTS both, directly and indirectly, has contributed to about 68% of the post-traumatic stress variant experienced by WTS. On the other hand, the violence committed by clients against the WTS does not directly make WTS stressed and even traumatic. The reason is that this condition (client violence) is considered a sexual right that WTS should give to his client. So when the client feels disappointed and dissatisfied with the services provided by WTS in cyber prostitution, the client has the right to protest, be disappointed, and even angry.

In cyber prostitution, the discrepancy between the reality of the WTS attitude and the client's expectations is understandable. Because before the meeting, both the client and the WTS did not have real preferences. The sources of information obtained were both images and text in online applications. This condition certainly has the potential to raise certain issues, one of which often arises is that expectations do not always match reality. This condition certainly has the potential to raise certain issues, one of which often arises is the client's expectations of WTS that do not match reality. Regarding these conditions, cyber WTS are generally able to be wise, especially in responding to the disappointments shown by the client to him. The violence committed by the client does not directly affect the WTS. They justified that this attitude was given to him because it was a sexual right that WTS should give to clients Alschech et al., (2020). That's why WTS consciously tend to accept when they are made the object of anger from clients if what they expect is not in the city.

B. Stigma against WTS
Society has its way of looking at people outside of it. Without realizing it, usually, all this time, society has made certain assumptions about how individuals outside themselves or their groups should act. Goffman (1963) says that society establishes ways to categorize people and complement certain attributes that members of each category feel familiar with and natural. An outsider (foreigner) comes before the community or a group, then, the first thing that tends to be seen is appearance as a form of anticipation of the category and its attributes such as social identity or social status to employment status.

Stigma in contemporary society is a negative construct, a sign of shame that communicates to others the fact that a person is unable to fulfil the expectations of social and cultural roles. A prerequisite for stigma is the idea of a perceived 'difference' between what is 'normal' and what is 'other'. Stigmatization itself is a process in which differential attributes are demeaned and discredited and become synonymous with deviance, resulting in the belief that people with stigma are not fully human' (Goffman, 1963). The thing that is often stigmatized because it is considered to have behaviour that is not by the rules or norms of most people is WTS.

So far, the burden received by WTS generally comes from stigma. The stigma attached to WTS not only has an impact on personal health but also changes the public's view of it. The burden of stigmatization is not only experienced by WTS from lower economic circles who work on the grounds of meeting the economic needs of their families. However, this stigmatization is also experienced by WTS who come from the middle-class economy and work independently through cyber networks with one of the goals being the need for adventure and experimentation. Koken (2012) in his research revealed that although WTSs work independently and in a private space (online, because they are afraid of being stigmatized, most of them tend to choose to remain secretive about their status as WTSs, even to their closest relatives. WTS usually only dare to open up to fellow WTS who are in their community or to people outside their community, but even then only to people they trust.

In Koken's research (2020) it is known that currently many WTS want to quit their jobs. However, they did not immediately take this decision because they were afraid of the consequences that would have to be faced in the future. This is because these consequences can not only threaten economic conditions but also triggers other impacts from the disappearance of these economic resources. This condition is feared to have an impact on the loss of status and social access of WTS to various resources, as well as difficulties in blending in and building relationships with the surrounding environment.

Another impact of negative stigma against WTS is the loss of confidence in themselves and the environment because they feel isolated. In research conducted by Weitzer (2018), it was stated that stigma has existed for a long time, but the focus on how to eliminate stigma from all types of sex as stripping, commercial sex work, pornography, and prostitution, can be quite limited. Whereas so far the stigma that has developed in society has made WTS live in a world full of falsehood. This makes WTS have to live their private life double by hiding the type of work they do from the environment; denying that they are involved in the sex trade; using a pseudonym or creating a new personal biography and living a double life in other ways.

Stigma has made WTS seem like they don't have a world of their own. This condition finally forced many WTS to never make peace with themselves and their environment. The topic of stigma against WTS is also researched by Simpson & Smith (2021) with a focus area on institutional discrimination against female prostituted students (WTSP) in the UK and Australia. His research reveals that the transformation of sexual business services from conventional to cyber in the two countries is still unable to reduce the growing stigma. Whereas the transformation of business services has allowed WTSP to work in silence and alone. However, this condition did not have a significant effect on WTS from being stigmatized.

The study revealed that the negative stigma about sex workers has made WTSP feel isolated due to their employment status, although the main reason students choose to become cyber WTS is to meet their educational needs. The student's status as a WTS was forced to be hidden because it could threaten his school career. The school does not allow students to take alternative steps to meet the needs of their school. This implies that they (the educational institution where they study) cannot accept students who have side jobs as WTS even if it is for the sake of meeting the cost of education.

Goffman (1963) himself assumes that stigma is ultimately not an essential feature of an attribute such as a physical mark that looks like a severe facial burn but rather appears as a result of social reactions to that attribute. Stigma is a social product produced by social interactions where potentially stigmatizing attributes can have an impact on the expectations or behaviour of one party (Green, 2009).

In this case, the impact of stigma in the form of institutional discrimination has finally forced WTSP to live with a double burden which slowly continues to erode them mentally, not only at school but also at home. However, the institution itself does not necessarily take wise steps such as providing cost relief assistance or scholarships to economically disadvantaged students. As a result, students still carry out their activities on the same basis, namely meeting the demands of their education costs, although by selling themselves through cyber prostitution.

WTS Service Transformation
Prostitution has various forms that grow and develop according to the times. There is prostitution whose practice can be easily identified, such as in brothels/localizations, dimly lit areas (long-distance traffic lanes), or among street prostitutes who roam in open places to sell themselves. There are also hidden prostitution practices that are not easily recognized because the perpetrators are under the guise of carrying out non-prostitution activities (Rusyidi & Nurwati, 2019).

One of the service products of the advancement of the digital era is the emergence of the phenomenon of cyber prostitution which in recent years has become a fairly hot issue. The transformation of prostitution has brought many changes, one of which is the pattern of communication and prostitution transactions in cyber prostitution.

In cyber prostitution, managers offer commercial sex services through a website, including those involving artists or celebrities. The website displays pictures of WTS in very sensual poses as well as contact numbers that can be contacted by interested parties. If a transaction has occurred, the manager/pimp will bring the ordered WTS to a place determined by the customer such as a hotel or apartment. This type of contemporary prostitution practice is very difficult to identify because the practice is very closed and selective (Surtees, 2004).

Judging from its shape, cyber prostitution has several forms of online sexual services such as sex video calls, phone sex, and sex chat, but what is being discussed as a topic of discussion is having sex directly. Therefore, in terms of services (sexual practices), there is no significant difference between cyber and conventional prostitution. This means that in this model, the user and the WTS are still required to meet face-to-face to have sexual intercourse. It's just that the difference is in the transaction methods, all of which use cyber media, from how to arrange a meeting place to price negotiations. During this time, WTS will be faced with risks such as being abused, stigmatized, and often being lied to.

Laksono (2014) in his research revealed that in the current digital era, people are encouraged to form a new society/community with a cyber approach. In his research, it is stated that the emergence of cyber communities does not necessarily make the prostitution business recede prostitution activities continue and shift towards more massive virtual transactions that can be carried out anytime and anywhere. This shift has brought a lot of advantages for business people in it, especially prostitution.

Prostitution in the cyber community or called cyber prostitution has become a social phenomenon in the era of digitalization. Through internet media, WTS offers sex services on certain internet sites or internet-based applications. The nature of cyberspace is difficult to control because it is beyond everything and anarchic make cyber prostitution activities able to take place freely. In this community, the WTS save power over themselves compared to them doing business conventionally by relying on pimps/*germo*. In this study, it is stated by Laksono (2014) that when social control over the practice of prostitution in the real world is tight, cyberspace gives prostitution a space to grow more freely.

The shift of WTS from conventional prostitution to cyber itself is massive and this condition occurs not without reason. In addition to the economy, the encouragement factor from the surrounding environment is one thing that should be underlined. Natasya et al. (2017) in his research revealed the reasons why most of the WTS plunged into cyber prostitution, including trauma due to the past because they had been victims of rape, felt happy when they could channel their sexual desire, and wanted to get recognition from their environment financially. This financial security is considered to be able to meet their other needs, namely to become famous and to be able to live in luxury

The transformation of prostitution has also given WTS independence in attracting clients. Changes in structure in cases of cyber prostitution can be seen in the structural model of running a sex service business, which was originally through a pimp agency to become an independent model through social media accounts that many managed independently. In this respect WTS has taken control of itself and what they offer its customers.

In Fadri's research (2020) it is written that the transformation of prostitution has stages and problems that prostitution actors go through on their own. The desire to be independent is a very strong basis for WTS to finally choose to switch from pure prostitution (with pimp ties) to independent prostitution (using social media as a place to offer sex services).

Similar to the findings in other studies, this study illustrates that profit is the core of why WTS switches from conventional prostitution to cyber prostitution. The advantages/profits of cyber prostitution have shown that prostitution is no longer a way of survival for women vulnerable to economic hardship, but rather leads to the fulfilment of consumptive styles or current trends. This is the basis for WTS's activity to seek profit in cyber prostitution.

Cyber prostitution itself is a new work vehicle for WTS which continues to show a significant trend of increasing even though it is included in the category of work that is vulnerable to stigma and threats from around, both clients and parties or security forces. The real problem with this WTS service transformation is that WTS generally do not have sufficient knowledge of technology and regulations as well as their readiness to face the risks that will be faced when serving customers. This condition ultimately makes WTS one of the most vulnerable/risky subjects to legal sanctions, acts of violence, and public stigmatization in the practice of cyber prostitution.

The transformation from conventional prostitution to cyber prostitution is an opportunity for WTS to still be able to meet their economic needs and increase welfare levels, even though it is accompanied by various threats in it. In this business, WTS is required to be able to integrate social

reality in real life with the digital realm, where this can only be done if WTS can utilize its social capital in cyber activities.

The social capital in question is synonymous with social connections in that it is an aggregation of actual or potential resources associated with network ownership. Each individual generally has social capital originating from the past which has been institutionalized through mutual recognition. Institutionalization is important as the basis for these individuals to access other capital from the social capital network they will have in the future. However, the general condition is that the institutionalization of social capital as a network asset is rarely carried out, as a result, the relationships that have been built in the past are not able to have a significant impact on life in the future (Lin, 2001).

If the ownership and utilization of WTS social capital are not able to be optimized, then WTS is likely to be in a quite dangerous situation, considering the stigma given to WTS by the community in the surrounding environment continues to occur. In addition, WTS is also the target object of the law enforced in various regions.

Utilization of social capital can also be a means for WTS to be able to work safely and avoid threats of violence from customers. Therefore, if this condition continues, WTS will not only feel isolated and discriminated against, face threats from the security forces, and their safety will be threatened while carrying out their profession as WTS in cyber prostitution.

Social Resilience of WTS
Resilience is a set of behaviours over time that reflect the interactions between individuals and their environment, particularly regarding the willingness to access and opportunities to support personal growth (Ungar, 2012). Schoon (2006) in Ungar (2012) said that if understood in a complex and multidimensional way, resilience is highly dependent on the capacity of the individual's physical and social ecology to be able to make the capacity of individuals a potentially positive value that can encourage them to be able to exercise their right based on of personal choice even under pressure or pressure. even in recovery from risk exposure. In general, resilience is accepted as a relative resistance to the experience of environmental risk, coping with stress or adversity, or a relatively good outcome despite experiencing risk (Rutter, 2006).

Various stigmas and public reactions to WTS themselves have had a significant impact on how WTS survive in living life with various experiences that have given a lot of burdens. Smith (2020) in his research tries to examine the childhood experiences of WTS which are correlated with their current living conditions, namely related to difficulties, resilience, and work motivation among other WTS. The data presented deal with a broad view of the motivation, criminalization, stigmatization, social relations, and mental health of WTS. The results of this study reveal that 1) the correlation between Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACES) and resilience is very weak; 2) ACES does not have a positive relationship with WTS work motivation; 3) There is a significant relationship between resilience and work motivation of WTS. The conclusion from the research is that WTS who are proven to be more resilient can be assumed to work based on their own choice regardless of their background.

Self-resistance by Rouhani et al. (2021) is said to represent adaptability and empowerment and can buffer the consequences of a person's traumatic event. This research tries to compare resilience

between cisgender women and transgender sex workers by observing consistent patterns in the correlation of resilience, such as access to housing, the impact of interpersonal violence, and portraits of support provided.

The study found that 92% of cisgender sex workers and 57% of transgender women reported having been neglected. This finding also highlights the extent to which the safety level of the surrounding environment has the potential to affect the resilience of sex workers. The data presented in this study shows that a greater impact of violence on the resilience of sex workers is actuated by the violence they have recently experienced (both in the environment where they live and work), than events that have been experienced in the past.

Regarding their resilience, WTS tend to find it difficult to survive if they live alone. In a study conducted by Lam (2020) regarding the inequality of the social support system carried out by most governments around the world for sex workers during the Covid-19 pandemic, one of which is government protection and health services.

Utilization of social capital is an important step for WTS to provide a sense of security during work or activities in the practice of cyber prostitution, at least social capital can function as a filter or social safety net for WTS. Putnam (1995) says that social capital facilitates coordination and cooperation for mutual benefit. Social capital has been defined as "the sum of the actual and potential resources embedded in, available through, and derived from the network of existing relationships (Chiu et al., 2006).

Coleman himself emphasizes two aspects of social structure that are very important in facilitating the creation and development of social capital in various forms (Lin, 2004). First, is the aspect of social structure that creates confinement in a social network that makes everyone interconnected in such a way that obligations and sanctions can be imposed on everyone who is a member of the network. Second, there is a social organization that can be used to achieve common goals.

WTS' ability to protect themselves depends on their 'work environment. Not only that, the availability of community support, access to health and social services, and aspects of the wider legal and economic environment are other important aspects. From the data presented in the study, the majority of sex workers experience difficulties, loss of income, increased and d discrimination to harassment due to the criminalization of sex workers, especially during difficult times such as the Covid-19 pandemic.

As one of the efforts for WTS to survive during the pandemic, the marginalized, stigmatized and criminalized sex community has developed a rapid response strategy by utilizing social capital to help other colleagues overcome challenges. The actions took the form of preparing emergency funds, mutual aid funds, and developing resources through programs and campaigns. Social networks owned by WTS have an important role in supporting the resilience of WTS, not only during famine times such as a pandemic but also in daily activities.

The social relationships that WTS builds themselves can be seen as the 'glue' that holds society together: relationships between people, people doing things for one another out of a sense of obligation and social reciprocity, social solidarity, and community. Part of building social capital is strengthening 'civil society' (Ife, 2013). In addition, this social relationship itself can be used as

an alternative for WTS to be a little free from the burden of stigma that has been obtained from the environment so far.

CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that the stigmatization obtained by WTS in prostitution activities both conventionally and cyber has given various impacts, one of which is stress or mental pressure with varying levels. The stigmatization obtained has also limited the access of WTS to their open social environment. WTS's social life is generally spent with fellow WTS who are members of a community or network. This is the capital that is used as the basis for WTS to survive in carrying out work and daily life even with double burdens.

The digital era has given birth to a new phenomenon in the world of prostitution. Technological sophistication has pushed prostitution services to transform from conventional to digital. The prostitution business, which was initially concentrated in certain places, has now spread to various places without knowing the exact location of its existence. Transaction patterns with WTS can also be carried out personally through social media applications without having to involve pimps any more. The changes that have occurred have had an impact on the pattern or way WTS in providing services. In addition, another impact that is quite vital for WTS is the change in the WTS capital structure such as networks, collective assets, and trust from clients.

Based on the various issues that have developed related to prostitution, it can be said that cyber prostitution has brought more risks than benefits. Although cyber prostitution can provide many financial benefits for WTS, the open and private nature of cyber prostitution (which allows WTS to run the business independently without involving pimps) guarantees the security of WTS in it can be said to be vulnerable. WTS are at high risk of being stigmatized, verbally abusive, physically abusive, and even death threats.

In cyber prostitution so that WTS can survive and avoid problems, WTS should be able to adapt to changes, be good at identifying problems, understand the potential of every interaction made with customers through digital applications/media, and be able to integrate social values and old sexual culture (conventional prostitution) with a new sexual value (cyber prostitution). In addition, WTS must be able to manage and optimize its social capital. Social capital itself in practice can be regarded as a seat belt that can provide guarantees for WTS to be able to work safely, and comfortably, and able to provide economic benefits for WTS sustainably.

REFERENCES

Alschech, J., Regehr, C., Logie, C. H., & Seto, M. C. (2020). Contributors to posttraumatic stress symptoms in women sex workers. American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, *90*(5), 567–577. https://doi.org/10.1037/ort0000457

Chiu, C. M., Hsu, M. H., & Wang, E. T. G. (2006). Understanding knowledge sharing in virtual communities: An integration of social capital and social cognitive theories. Decision Support Systems, 42(3), 1872–1888. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dss.2006.04.001

CNN Indonesia. (2021). 82 Remaja Terjaring Prostitusi Online di Hotel Koja Jakarta . https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20210318091426-12-618976/82-remaja-terjaring-prostitusi-online-di-hotel-koja-jakarta

Detiknews.com. (2020). PSK Online di Bekasi Dibunuh Pelanggan Gara-gara Ini. https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5228945/psk-online-di-bekasi-dibunuh-pelanggan-gara-gara-ini

Fadri, Z. (2020). Perubahan Struktural Fungsional Prostitusi Online dalam Pandangan Talcott Parsons. RESIPROKAL: Jurnal Riset Sosiologi Progresif Aktual, *2*(2), 211–223. https://doi.org/10.29303/resiprokal.v2i2.40

Goffman, E. (1963). Stigma; Notes on the management of spoiled identity. Jason Aronson, New York, N.Y., (147 p.) $. https://doi.org/10.2307/2575995

Green, G. (2009). The end of stigma?: Changes in the social experience of long-term illness. In The End of Stigma?: Changes in the Social Experience of Long-Term Illness. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203881798

Ife, J. (2013). Community Development In Uncertain World (p. 386).

Indah & Kartasasmita. (2018). Gambaran Learned Helplessness Wanita Tuna Susila Yang Mengalami Kekerasan. Jurnal Muara Ilmu Sosial, Humaniora, Dan Seni, *1*(2), 11. https://doi.org/10.24912/jmishumsen.v1i2.984

Jatmikowati, S. H. (2015). Driving Factors and Their Characteristics of Prostitutes in Indonesia: A Phenomenology Approach. Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, *6*(6), 554–560. https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2015.v6n6s1p554

Juditha, C. (2021). Prostitusi Daring : Tren Industri Jasa Seks Komersial di Media Sosial Online Prostitution : Trends of The Commercial Sex Service Industry in Social Media. 51–64. https://doi.org/10.30818/jpkm.2021.2060106

Juli, S., & Marina, R. (2019). Tensions between feminist principles and the demand for prostitution in the neoliberal age : A critical analysis of sex buyers ' discourse Tensiones entre los principios feministas un análisis crítico del discurso de los sujetos prostituyentes. *24*(2), 109–128.

Koken, J. A. (2012). Independent Female Escort's Strategies for Coping with Sex Work Related Stigma. Sexuality and Culture, 16(3), 209–229. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-011-9120-3

Kominfo. (2019). Kementerian Komunikasi dan Informatika. https://www.kominfo.go.id/content/detail/15872/tiap-bulan-kominfo-jaring-1000-konten-prostitusi-online/0/sorotan_media

Laksono, P. (2014). Cyber Prostitution: Bergesernya Masalah Sosial Ke Dalam Ruang Virtual. Jurnal Analisa Sosiologi, 3(1), 53–69.

Lam, E. (2020). Pandemic sex workers' resilience: COVID-19 crisis met with rapid responses by sex worker communities. International Social Work, *63*(6), 777–781. https://doi.org/10.1177/0020872820962202

Lin, N. (2001). Social Capital: Theory and Research. In Social Capital: Theory and Research. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315129457

Lin, N. (2004). Social Capital: A Theory of Social Structure and Action.

Munawaroh, S. (2015). Pekerja Seks Komersial (Psk) Di Wilayah Prambanan, Kabupaten Klaten, Jawa Tengah. DIMENSIA: Jurnal Kajian Sosiologi, *4*(2), 69–82. https://doi.org/10.21831/dimensia.v4i2.3433

Murdiyanto, M. (2020). Dampak Penutupan Lokalisasi terhadap Pekerja Seks Komersial (PSK) dan Sosial Ekonomi Masyarakat Sekitar. Media Informasi Penelitian Kesejahteraan Sosial, 43(3), 195–210.

Natasya, Kusyogo, & Aditya. (2017). Fenomena Prostitusi Online Di Jakarta Selatan. Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat (e-Journal), 5(1), 519–527.

Nguyen, T., & Li, X. (2020). Understanding public-stigma and self-stigma in the context of dementia: A systematic review of the global literature. Dementia, *19*(2), 148–181. https://doi.org/10.1177/1471301218800122

Rouhani, S., Decker, M. R., Tomko, C., Silberzahn, B., Allen, S. T., Park, J. N., Footer, K. H. A., & Sherman, S. G. (2021). Resilience among Cisgender and Transgender Women in Street-Based Sex Work in Baltimore, Maryland. Women's Health Issues, *31*(2), 148–156. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.whi.2020.11.002

Rutter, M. (2012). Resilience: Causal Pathways and Social Ecology.

Rusyidi, B., & Nurwati, N. (2019). Penanganan Pekerja Seks Komersial Di Indonesia. Prosiding Penelitian Dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat, 5(3), 303. https://doi.org/10.24198/jppm.v5i3.20579

Simpson, J., & Smith, C. (2021). Students, sex work and negotiations of stigma in the UK and Australia. Sexualities, 24(3), 474–490. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363460720922733

Smith, K. R. (2020). Resiliency, adversity, and autonomy experiences of sex work employees. Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering, 81(9-B). http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=psyh&AN=2020-28118-121&site=ehost-live

Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. Journal of Business Research, 104(March), 333–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039

Statistik.jakarta.go.id. (2020, April 27). Penjangkauan dan Penertiban Penyandang Masalah Kesejahteraan Sosial (PMKS). https://statistik.jakarta.go.id/hasil-penjangkauan-dan-penertiban-penyandang-masalah-kesejahteraan-sosial-pmks-dki-jakarta/

Surtees, R. (2004). Traditional and Emergent Sex Work in Urban Indonesia. Intersections: Gender, History and Culture in the Asian Context, Issue 10, August 2004. http://intersections.anu.edu.au/issue10/surtees.html#n33

Tribun News. (2021). Ungkap Kasus Prostitusi Online di Jakbar, Polisi Amankan 75 Orang, 18 di Antaranya Masih Anak-anak. https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2021/05/24/ungkap-kasus-prostitusi-online-di-jakbar-polisi-amankan-75-orang-18-di-antaranya-masih-anak-anak?page=1

Ungar, M. (2012). Social Ecology of Resilience.

Weitzer, R. (2018). Resistance to sex work stigma. Sexualities, *21*(5–6), 717–729. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363460716684509

Yanto, O. (2016). Prostitusi Online Sebagai Kejahatan Kemanusiaan terhadap Anak: Telaah Hukum Islam dan Hukum Positif. AHKAM : Jurnal Ilmu Syariah, *16*(2), 187–196. https://doi.org/10.15408/ajis.v16i2.4449