

Bilingual Instruction in SMAN Bali Mandara: Student's Perspective

Ni Putu Ayu Niya Loviyani[✉], Ni Nyoman Padmadewi², and Luh Putu Artini³

¹²³ Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha

[✉]Jalan Udayana No. 11, Singaraja 81116, Bali, Indonesia

Article Info

Article History

Received:

Oct 2023

Accepted:

Feb 2024

Published:

Mar 2024

Keywords:

*Bilingual Instruction,
English, Indonesia*

ABSTRACT

This research aimed to investigate 11th-grade students' perceptions regarding the utilization of bilingual instruction at SMAN Bali Mandara. Employing a qualitative approach, the researcher analyzed data obtained through questionnaires and interviews to gain deeper insights into student perspectives. Analysis revealed that the majority of responses clustered around central tendencies, with seven statements garnering over 80% agreement, while the remaining two statements received lower agreement rates of 46% and 42%, respectively. Overall, students expressed a positive view of bilingual instruction, viewing it as a beneficial tool for enhancing their learning experiences. Consequently, this study contributes to the understanding of the significance and effectiveness of bilingual instruction in language education, with the potential to improve students' language skills.

2024 Politeknik Negeri Bali

INTRODUCTION

The bilingual education initiative, launched in 2004 and gaining momentum (Erci B., 2012), reflects the global trend of English learning driven by globalization. With the increasing demand for English proficiency across various sectors, including the labour market and education, Indonesia, as an ASEAN member, emphasizes English as its primary foreign language (Eka, 2018). This aligns with the concentric circles model of English's spread, expanding its reach beyond traditional foreign language contexts. English instruction has extended from primary to university levels in recent decades (Aldosari & Alsultan, 2017), with a growing focus on bilingual programs at pre-university and university levels. Despite efforts, English proficiency among Indonesian high school graduates remains low (Wirawan, 2020). Nevertheless, educational institutions are increasingly adopting bilingual programs, viewing English as a potential enrolment booster and reputation enhancer. This study was conducted in a secondary school that implemented a bilingual curriculum in 2014. Being able to interact using two languages is an inevitable component of a bilingual classroom's simultaneous use of the students' L1 and L2 during instruction and learning. In addition, the shift occurs when teaching emergent bilingual students who are in the process of learning a second language for academic purposes. Multilingual teachers may find it necessary to speak with their students in a combination of languages. The act of swiftly switching between two languages is known as code-switching. In the past few decades, bilingual instruction has been the focus of substantial research in response to the requirements of specific local classroom contexts. Research on bilingual instruction in the classroom has been conducted most frequently in two contexts: second language classes (English as a Second Language/English as a Foreign Language Classrooms) and bilingual education classrooms (Theory et al., 2002).

Some educators feel that enabling students to be near a native speaker will aid in their learning and acquisition of a new language (Aldosari & Alsultan, 2017). This view is particularly prevalent among those who teach English to students with poor levels of English proficiency. In addition, one must have at least a basic understanding of the target language before attempting to acquire it at an advanced level. Because second language learning follows first language acquisition, familiarity with the first language must serve as a basis for second language acquisition. To study a second

language, pupils must have a solid command of their first tongue (L1). The student's familiarity with their native language acts as a tool for achieving advanced competency in the target language or second language (L2). In the Indonesian context, however, neither a regulation nor a policy of any educational institution governs the use of language instruction for English language learning (ELL). English as a Second Language (ESL) teachers have unlimited control over the linguistic content of their sessions for pupils. Only the personal views and pedagogical methods of teachers influence the linguistic development of kids in the classroom. Additionally, educators have two alternatives when determining which language to use in their ELL classrooms: (1) English alone, or (2) English that is integrated with another language (L1).

Bilingual instruction is a topic that has gained significant attention in educational research (Osterling & Foz, 2004). Previous studies have shown that bilingual instruction can have positive effects on students' language development, cognitive abilities, and academic achievement. These studies have contributed to the ongoing debate about the concept of the "bilingual advantage" and whether it is a valid claim (Poarch & Krott, 2019). This has led to the ongoing debate about whether or not the reported differences between bilinguals and monolinguals in favour of bilinguals are real. The debate surrounding the "bilingual advantage" has focused on determining whether the reported differences between bilinguals and monolinguals in favour of bilinguals are statistically significant and generalizable across different contexts and populations. This document asserts that dual language education is a program that has the potential to promote the multilingual and multicultural competencies necessary for the new global business job market (Learly & Kathryn, 2000). The appeal of dual language programs is that they combine successful educational models in an integrated classroom composed of both language majority and language minority students, with the goals of bilingualism and biliteracy, academic excellence for both groups and multicultural competencies.

Given English's importance as a worldwide language, it is advantageous for language instructors to find the easiest ways to teach English to their students; bilingual instruction is one such strategy (Rukmi & Khasanah, 2020). Giving bilingual instruction between English and Bahasa Indonesia is prevalent in Indonesian classrooms because both teachers and students are Indonesian and Bahasa Indonesia is the primary language of the majority of Indonesian students. Bilingual instruction occurs frequently in regular conversation. According to Sumintono & Bambang (2012), the majority of English teachers incorporate Bahasa Indonesia into their lessons by asking questions, providing examples, and elaborating on themes in the language. It is crucial to highlight that English as a second language teachers who periodically switch to another language out of necessity do not always demonstrate a lack of proficiency in English.

Bilingual instruction refers to the use of two languages, usually the national language and a foreign language, as the medium of instruction in educational settings. Bilingual instruction has gained attention and popularity in recent years due to its potential benefits for students. Research studies have shown that bilingual instruction can lead to cognitive benefits such as improved problem-solving skills, greater cognitive flexibility, and better metalinguistic awareness. In the context of Bali Mandara High School, understanding students' perspectives on bilingual instruction is crucial for the effective implementation and improvement of the program. Previous studies have highlighted the importance of considering students' attitudes, motivation, and perceived challenges in bilingual education.

When evaluating the potential benefits and challenges of bilingual instruction, factors such as language proficiency, cultural identity, and academic achievement should be considered. By exploring previous studies and identifying the gap in current research, this study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of students' perspectives on bilingual instruction at Bali Mandara High School. Source: The use of Indonesian in International class programs was perceived to benefit students, particularly in terms of developing their speaking and writing skills, understanding new English vocabulary, and comprehending teachers' explanations. One previous study examined the use of Indonesian in an International class program and found that it was perceived to benefit students in terms of developing their speaking and writing.

Several recent studies have delved into the area of bilingual instruction and its impact on student perspectives. In a study by Huang (2018), findings echoed the benefits of bilingual instruction highlighting improved language skills and better comprehension of academic content. Similarly, a study by Lin & He (2019) further explored the advantages of bilingual

instruction, emphasizing its positive impact on students' cognitive development and academic achievement. Moreover, a study by Crosson (2019) provided insights into students' attitudes towards bilingual education, shedding light on their overall satisfaction and motivation levels in language learning. Another recent study by Abduh (2018) focused specifically on the use of the local language in bilingual instruction, showing how it can foster a sense of cultural identity and inclusivity among students. Lastly, a study by Harman & Khote (2018) investigated the role of bilingual instruction in preparing students for future career paths, emphasizing its relevance in enhancing global communication skills and cultural competence.

Previous studies have shown that students perceive benefits in terms of language development and understanding when bilingual instruction is implemented. The gap in current research lies in the specific context of Bali Mandara High School and its students' perspectives on bilingual instruction. There is a need to gather data and insights directly from the students at Bali Mandara High School to understand their experiences, preferences, and challenges related to bilingual instruction. Understanding students' perspectives on bilingual instruction in Bali Mandara High School is essential for the effective implementation and improvement of the program. By conducting research and gathering data from students, this study aims to fill the gap in knowledge regarding students' perspectives on bilingual instruction in Bali Mandara High School.

SMAN Bali Mandara has a similar occurrence. Despite the school's requirement that English be used exclusively in all teaching and learning activities, the English instructor at SMAN Bali Mandara continues to struggle with teaching entirely in English. As evident from the preliminary interview, the English instructor will regularly adopt code-switching when teaching particular components of the English language. The school has rules in the usage of normal English. The appliance is quite hard to use fully in English and the teacher implies that bilingual instruction is important for the students' language acquisition. This was done so that the students' thoughts regarding the bilingual instruction of their English teacher could be heard clearly.

The author discovered the program's popularity and enrolment had been shoddy. Both Bahasa Indonesia and English were expected to be utilized in the classroom, although there was no stimulation on their relative usage. They planned an English Day to be used during the teaching and learning process and daily interaction, but it was still difficult to implement the program and get all students to speak in English from Monday to Friday. That is why some student council members and other selected students were recruited as language spies. Furthermore, it is impractical because some students can still utilize Bahasa Indonesia when there is no spy present. Others utilized English-language resources in addition to Bahasa Indonesia textbooks. The researcher also found that the students in this program had trouble paying attention in class and occasionally misunderstood their instructors' instructions. To improve their exposure to the language, they expected to hear English spoken in the classroom. Based on the phenomenon, the use of bilingual instruction in SMAN Bali Mandara is needed by the students to make the students understand the instructions. Despite the potential benefits of bilingual instruction, there is a gap in the research literature regarding the long-term effects of bilingual education on students' academic and professional success. More longitudinal studies are needed to track the progress of students who have received bilingual instruction throughout their academic journey and into their professional careers.

Understanding the long-term impact of bilingual education will provide valuable insights into its effectiveness and potential benefits for students in the long run. Moreover, while there is evidence supporting the cognitive advantages of bilingualism, there is a lack of comprehensive research on the social and emotional aspects of bilingual instruction. It would be beneficial to explore how bilingual education influences students' social interactions, self-esteem, and cultural identity. In addition to the academic and cognitive aspects, it is important to consider the practical implementation of bilingual instruction in diverse educational settings. Factors such as teacher training, curriculum development, and parental involvement play crucial roles in the success of bilingual programs. Further research into these practical aspects can contribute to the effective design and implementation of bilingual education initiatives. This makes the research interesting because the researcher would like to do the research with the students to find out the perception of the students towards the use of bilingual instruction in the class and daily activities.

METHODS

This study employs a description of the student's perspective by using a qualitative research approach (Creswell, 2009) that seeks to illuminate the murky terrain of the subjective human experience (Colón & Heineke, 2015). The ontological aspects can be understood through the use of multiple pieces of evidence, usually based on experience and social interaction. SMA N Bali Mandara was the name of the high school where the study was conducted. It was chosen because this school included bilingual instruction at the secondary education level. There are a total of 50 students in 11th grade from a school in Singaraja, Bali, Indonesia who filled out the questionnaires for this study, however, only 10 were interviewed. These 10 students were chosen by using purposive random sampling based on the criteria needed by the researcher. (Merriam, 2009) argued that the motivation for conducting qualitative research is typically the researcher's curiosity. As the researcher had already witnessed issues with the school's bilingual program, she reasoned that the institution would provide an excellent setting in which to further investigate these issues. The increasing use of English in daily life may help to explain this pattern.

Furthermore, embracing a qualitative research framework will enable the amplification of marginalized voices within the context of bilingual education. It will provide a platform for students from diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds to share their narratives, thereby contributing to a more comprehensive and inclusive understanding of bilingual education's impact. Incorporating qualitative research methodologies will also pave the way for the co-creation of knowledge, where students actively participate in shaping the narrative of bilingual education. This collaborative process acknowledges the expertise and insights that students bring to the table, elevating their voices as valuable sources of knowledge and understanding. In conclusion, qualitative research that centres on the experiences and perspectives of students is essential for filling the existing gap in bilingual education research. By embracing qualitative methodologies, researchers can amplify the voices of students, enriching the scholarly discourse on bilingual education and paving the way for more inclusive and student-centred approaches to educational research and program development.

This research compiled its data using a questionnaire and in-person interviews with students (Rukmi & Khasanah, 2020). First, the children in the sampling English class were given a questionnaire to fill out. The primary goal of the questionnaire was to collect demographic information, while the primary goal of the semi-structured interviews was to supplement and expand upon the raw data from the questionnaire by eliciting specific information about students' languages used (English and Indonesian) in their English language classes. The researcher processes the data based on a dichotomous scale to count and classify the data received from the questionnaire to determine the students' perspective on using bilingual instruction in the classroom (Mirhadizadeh, 2016).

Next, in-depth interviews were performed with the students for this research. The interview served as a memory trigger, semi-structured or otherwise. The interviews were conducted to gain insight into the participants' genuine behaviour during their experiences in bilingual instruction during teaching and learning. To complete the data, the researcher visits the classrooms to identify themselves and explain the goal of the study. Researchers offered an invitation to participate in semi-structured interviews with students who expressed interest. To get insight into the participants and the classroom settings, the researcher conducted semi-structured interviews with a subset of the participants before conducting the observation. The interview was recorded for later playback and analysis, and its transcription and interpretation shed light on the students' opinions about the use of bilingual instruction in the teaching and learning process.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Data from Questionnaire

As bilingual instruction becomes more prevalent in educational settings, it is important to understand the perspectives and experiences of students. This questionnaire aims to gather valuable data about the students' perspective on bilingual instruction at Bali Mandara High School. By exploring their attitudes, challenges, and preferences, we can gain insights that will inform and improve the bilingual education program. This research endeavour seeks to contribute to the ongoing dialogue about bilingualism in education and its impact on student learning and development. Several theories are used in this research, namely, perception theory (Harnard, 1987; Kumar, 2010), the bilingual approach (Brown, 2001; Celce-

Murcia, 2001; Saville-Troike, 2006), and the roles and reasons for L1 usage in EFL classrooms were the theoretical foundations for the questionnaire results (Kelilo, 2012; Tsukamoto, 2011).

| No | Statement | Percentage for the agreed responses | Interpretation |
|----|--|-------------------------------------|----------------|
| 1 | Using both Indonesia and English language in the classroom helps you learn English | 90% | Very strong |
| 2 | Using bilingual instruction in an English classroom helps you to understand the lesson | 86% | Very strong |
| 3 | Using bilingual instruction helps students understand the material | 86% | Very strong |
| 4 | Using bilingual instruction in English classrooms enhances your speaking skills. | 88% | Very strong |
| 5 | Using bilingual instruction in an English classroom helps your teacher explain the materials. | 84% | strong |
| 6 | Using bilingual instruction in an English classroom makes you understand the teacher's explanation in every sentence. | 88% | strong |
| 7 | Using bilingual instruction by the teacher in an English classroom improves your English writing skills. | 46% | enough |
| 8 | Using the Indonesian language by the teacher in an English classroom increases your understanding of English vocabulary. | 42% | enough |

Table 1: Students' responses about the use of bilingualism in SMA N Bali Mandara
 [source: students' questionnaire. Adapted from Kelilo, 2012; Tsukamoto, 2011]

The results backed up what had been found in Kelilo, 2012 and Krashen, 1987 who found that students had a favourable attitude toward language education in their English classes. The results of the questionnaire and interview analysis confirmed this conclusion. Survey results revealed that, across all eight questions, students were unanimous in their approval. Statement 1 suggests that pupils' positive use of English in the classroom is robust. The high degree of agreement around this statement (almost 90%) demonstrates that students have a clear understanding of their teacher's usage of a second language when instructing in English. Results from the survey also demonstrated that students had a favourable impression of the English lessons they had taken. Five statements (statements 2-6) from the students' completed questionnaires demonstrated this. More than 80% of students agreed or strongly agreed with these five assertions about the language used in the English classroom, indicating that they had a strong and favourable perspective of these statements. However, just a minority of students agree with assertion number 7, which suggests that having classes taught in Indonesian can help students' written English. It's because their teachers speak two languages in class, and it's difficult for them to grasp the grammatical structure of the sentences. Based on the responses to question 8, the researcher determined that fewer than half of the students (21 out of 50) agreed that their teacher's vocabulary was causing them confusion in the English class (see: statement no. 8 on the questionnaire). Six out of eight students agreed that the use of bilingual instruction may help them gain a deeper understanding, indicating a favourable perception of English among the students.

Data from Interview

The secondary data was coming from the interview session. Interview findings suggest that the teacher's bilingual instruction practices were generally favourable and that the teacher felt it was important to implement bilingual language

instruction in the English classes (Kelilo, 2012; Tsukamoto, 2011). They came to different conclusions about the benefits of bilingualism based on a variety of personal and experiential factors (Harnard, 1987; Kumar, 2010). However, this discussion will focus on addressing the second research question. The second study topic was to investigate the linguistic practices of English language learners. The evidence and discussions presented here show that there are positive outcomes for students who take on the challenge of learning English. The interview data revealed that students saw six advantages to the teacher's employment of a bilingual approach to the classroom. They benefited since it simplified concepts taught in English class. To put them at ease so that they could concentrate on learning. Facilitating their acquisition of fresh English words. Instructing them in physical activity and assisting as needed. The chance to receive clarification on course material from the instructor. Supporting them in improving their English reading comprehension skills. As a result of adopting a bilingual approach to teaching, students' English skills improved in four different areas as well (reading, writing, listening, and speaking). In contrast, being able to communicate clearly in writing was seen as increasingly valuable while learning English as a second language.

Some students thought that speaking only English in the classroom was the greatest way to expose themselves to the target language, while others thought that speaking both languages was the most practical approach to making steady progress in the target language. While the vast majority of students did hope to use English more frequently in the classroom, the preceding extract highlights an important point: when students anticipate an explanation in their native tongue, they tend to pay less attention to the explanation given in English. To communicate with others, students will use either their native language or a vernacular language (Aldosari & Alsultan, 2017; Rukmi & Khasanah, 2020). Due to English's widespread use, it is important to think about the complexities that arise when teaching the language. Teachers' knowledge, experience, the classroom environment, and their hopes and expectations for their students all play a role in the success of a program that uses English as the language of instruction.

Sometimes, the teacher has shifted some words, phrases, and sentences to Bahasa Indonesia because they want to make sure the students understand the material clearly. The teacher included Indonesian words and phrases in the English explanation because the teacher found it crucial to facilitate what her students needed to learn and retain. It appears that the teacher realized that continuing the explanation in English might not be enough to ensure that the students understood the material, so she switched to Bahasa Indonesia at this point. In contrast to theoretical proficiency, functional bilinguals communicate using both languages (Aldosari & Alsultan, 2017; Nooyen, 1999). This suggests that the extent to which a speaker can keep using the two languages throughout time is a significant component in the relationship between function and context. It is typical practice for students in bilingual education classes to be able to use both languages during classroom discussions (Eka, 2018; Mardiningrum, 2020). Bilingual instruction in the classroom is defined by Rukmi & Khasanah (2020) as "the simultaneous use of two or more languages by any member of the classroom community." Since "code" denotes methods of producing meaning or semiotic systems, code choice is more appropriate than bilingual instruction (Theory et al., 2002). Simply put, bilingual instruction in the classroom is the practice of alternating between two or more languages within the duration of a single speaking event (Hidayaturrohman, 2019). However, it was obvious that L1 was more important, especially amongst the kids for whom the classroom was a place where they were compelled to utilize English as part of the mandatory bilingual medium of instruction. Meanwhile, educators were aiding their own information transfer, classroom management, and student relationships.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study explores the efficacy of bilingual instruction in teaching English to 11th-grade students in Singaraja, Bali. Utilizing a teacher-implemented strategy, the majority of classrooms adopt a bilingual approach combining students' first language (L1) with English (L2) during instruction. Analysis of questionnaire and interview data reveals a generally positive perception among students toward bilingual instruction, with the majority agreeing with its use. However, students feel bilingual education has minimal impact on vocabulary and writing skills. Despite this, they cite advantages such as improved comprehension, vocabulary acquisition, task completion, class participation, and reading proficiency in English. These findings underscore the relevance and benefits of bilingual instruction in enhancing English language learning among students.

REFERENCES

- Abduh, A. (2018). Lecturers' perceptions on factors influencing the implementation of bilingual instruction in Indonesian universities. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education*, 10(3), 206-216. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1108/JARHE-04-2017-0034>
- Aldosari, A., & Alsultan, M. (2017). The Influence of Early Bilingual Education (English) on the First Language (Arabic) Literacy Skills in the Second Grade of Elementary School: Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 8(5), 135-142. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1895976902?accountid=14568>
- Brown, H. D. (2001). *Teaching by Principle and Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. Longman Inc.
- Celce-Murcia, M. (2001). *Teaching English as a Second or Foreign Language; Third Edition*. Heinle & Heinle.
- Colón, I., & Heineke, A. J. (2015). Bilingual Education in English-Only: A Qualitative Case Study of Language Policy in Practice at Lincoln Elementary School. *Mid-Western Educational Researcher*, 27(4), 271-295. <http://ezproxy.deakin.edu.au/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1086413&site=ehost-live&scope=site%5Cnhttp://www.mwera.org/MWER/volumes/v27/issue4/v27n4-Colon-FEATURE-ARTICLE.pdf>
- Creswell, J. (2009). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches (3rd ed.)*. CA Sage.
- Crosson, A. C., McKeown, M. G., Robbins, K. P., & Brown, K. J. (2019, Oct 10). Key elements of robust vocabulary instruction for emergent bilingual adolescents. *National Library of Medicine: National Center for Biotechnology Information*, 50(4), 493-505. doi:10.1044/2019_LSHSS-VOIA-18-0127
- Eka, L. S. (2018). The Effect of Bilingual Instruction to Students' Speaking Skill and Attitude. *Biomass Chem Eng*, 3(2), 108. http://journal.stainkudus.ac.id/index.php/equilibrium/article/view/1268/1127%0Ahttp://publicacoes.cardiol.br/portal/ijcs/portugues/2018/v3103/pdf/3103009.pdf%0Ahttp://www.scielo.org/co/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0121-75772018000200067&lng=en&tlng=
- Erci B. (2012). The effectiveness of bilingualism. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 68(4), 898-907.
- Harman, R. M., & Khote, N. (2018). Critical SFL praxis with bilingual youth: disciplinary instruction in a third space. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies*, 63-83. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/15427587.2017.1318663>
- Harnard, S. (1987). *Psychophysical and cognitive aspects of categorical perception: A critical overview*.
- Huang, B. H., Chang, Y.-H. S., Zhi, M., & Niu, L. (2018). The effect of input on bilingual adolescents' long-term language outcomes in a foreign language instruction context. *International Journal of Bilingualism*.
- Hidayaturrohman. (2019). International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding Code-Switching in Bilingual Society : A Case of Bima Family. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 810-816.
- Kelilo, J. . (2012). *Exploring the use of first language in "English focus" EFL classroom: Focus on Jimma teachers' college*. JIMMA University.
- Krashen, S. . (1987). *Principles and practice in the second language acquisition*. Pergamon Press.
- Learly, & Kathryn. (2000). *Biliteracy for a global society: An idea book on dual language education*.
- Lin, T., & He, Y. (2019). Does bilingual instruction impact students' academic performance in content-based learning? evidence from business school students attending bilingual and L1 courses. *Sustainability*, 263. doi:<https://doi.org/10.3390/su11010263>
- Mardiningrum, A. (2020). External Factors Affecting EFL Self-Concepts of Students in Two Drama Clubs. *Eralingua: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Asing Dan Sastra*, 4(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.26858/eralingua.v4i1.11402>
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative Research: A Guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco: CA: Jossey-Bass/Wiley.
- Mirhadizadeh, N. (2016). Internal and external factors in language change. *Internal and External Factors in Language Learning*, 1(5), 188-196.
- Nooyen, J. (1999). Sociolinguistics by Bernard Spolsky. *Issues in Applied Linguistics*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.5070/14101005015>
- Osterling, J., & Foz, R. (2004). The power of perspectives: building a cross-cultural community of learners (Vol. 7). *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. doi:DOI:10.1080/13670050408667827
- Poarch, G., & Krott, A. (2019). A bilingual advantage? An appeal for a change in perspective and recommendations for future research. *Behavioral Sciences*, 9(9), 95. doi:10.3390/bs9090095
- Rukmi, N. S., & Khasanah, N. (2020). Code Switching in Indonesia Bilingual Education. *ELTALL: English Language Teaching, Applied Linguistic and Literature*, 1(1), 32. <https://doi.org/10.21154/eltall.v1i1.2120>
- Saville-Troike, M. (2006). *Introducing second language acquisition*. Cambridge University Press.
- Sumintono, & Bambang, E. A. (2012). Too Difficult to Reach: A Case Study of the Implementation of Teaching-Learning With English In Indonesia's International Standard Schools. In: *Educational Issues, Research and Policies*. <http://eprints.utm.my/27805/>
- Theory, T. H. E., Open, O. F., & Systems, Q. (2002). Bilingual instruction and Bilingualism in the English language used Introduction. *Oxford University Press*, 649.
- Tsukamoto, M. (2011). *Students' perception of teachers' language use in an EFL classroom*. www.wilmina.ac.jp/ojc/edu/kiyo_%0A2011/kiyo_08_PDF/d2011_08.pdf

Wirawan, F. (2020). Teacher's Challenges in Teaching English at Panjura Private Senior High School in Malang. *Ensiklopedia of Journal*, 2(5), 113–123.